

Name: _____

Exercise C4, 11/9/04

Critical Review of First Drafts

Task: Read and critically review the drafts assigned to you. Note that the whole point of this exercise is that the authors get helpful feedback and can improve their papers. It is in the best interest of everyone that the reviews be accurate. Since the reviews will only be available on-line anonymously (you must not include hard copies in your evaluation folders), you must be (and can be) as critical as possible. Of course, you are also expected to be able to point out good points where applicable.

Review foci (for each draft)

1. Is the research question/problem clearly stated?
2. Is the cost or significance of the research question clearly stated in connection to some practical problem? Is the cost/significance convincing?
3. Does the draft follow the research-paper organization (i.e., Introduction: *background, problem/cost, response*; Conclusion: *results, significance, future*)?
4. Is the response (to the research question) logical and convincing?
5. Are there any assumptions that are *not* generally acceptable?
6. Are there any general issues with writing?
7. Is the draft “good” writing?
8. Questions/comments/suggestions

The web address for the drafts: http://www.tcnj.edu/~komagata/fsp111/04f/_____

Note that this information will also be sent to you by e-mail so that you can just click on the link.

Assigned Paper ID's: _____

Special instructions: How to submit this exercise

1. Submit your review to the instructor as an attachment to e-mail, at least one hour before the class time. Please contain all the reviews in a single file, but clearly label the reviews with the Paper ID's. Your reviews will be shared by the class on-line anonymously.
2. Also submit a hard copy of your review attached to this sheet.

Instructions/Notes:

1. Follow the general take-home exercise guidelines (as in previous modules).
2. Only for this exercise, **do not include it in your evaluation folder** (to protect the identity).
3. No length requirement

Survey: Time spent between classes: _____

// End